



**DRAFT MINUTES REGULAR MEETING
SCOTTSDALE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
ONE CIVIC CENTER - PROJECT REVIEW ROOMS 1, 2, AND 3
7447 E. INDIAN SCHOOL ROAD, SCOTTSDALE, AZ
THURSDAY, JUNE 8, 2006**

PRESENT: Ed Wimmer, Chairman
Nancy Dallett
Dezbah Hatathli
Kathy Howard
DeeJaye Lockwood

ABSENT: George Hartz, Vice-Chairman
Paul Winslow

STAFF: Debbie Abele, Historic Preservation Officer

OTHERS: Mark Philp, Allen & Philp Architects
Carol Garey
Valarie Hartzell
Tiffany Carlson
Ryan Clintworth
Adam Ochoa
Mike Bianchi
Harry Manne

CALL TO ORDER

The meeting was called to order by Chairman Wimmer at 5:33 p.m.

1. Introductions and Roll Call

A roll call confirmed the members present as stated above.

2. Minutes: May 11, 2006

COMMISSIONER LOCKWOOD MOVED TO APPROVE THE MINUTES OF THE MAY 11, 2006 MEETING AS WRITTEN. CHAIRMAN WIMMER SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED BY A UNANIMOUS VOTE OF SEVEN (7) TO ZERO (0).

3. Review/Possible Action: An amendment to the approved plans for Trader Vic's at the Hotel Valley Ho, 6850 E. Main St., Case 1-HP-2005#2

Ms. Abele brought to the attention of the Commissioners that their packets contained a brief staff report related to the request for an amendment to the approved Certificate of Appropriateness.

Approval is being sought for an item that was considered in Certificate Case #1-HP-2005 for the new construction of Trader Vic's. The color of steel beams are Chinese Red rather than the Hemlock Green color as stated on plans provided to the City. The City requires approval from the Commission for this color change in order to issue a permanent Certificate of Occupancy (C of O).

Mr. Mark Philp, 7030 East 5th Avenue, architect for Trader Vic's, explained that the color change was part of the design evolution and acknowledged that it was a mistake on his part for not referring back to the Commission. Mr. Philp referred to a picture depicting the areas in question—the Chinese red color is in keeping with different elements of the building and he felt the color is appropriate.

Chairman Wimmer noted that some of the tiles on the Northeast elevation were also different than what was on the original approved plans.

Commissioner Howard stated that color had not been an issue in historic neighborhoods and inquired as to why this was an issue with the Hotel Valley Ho property. Ms. Abele explained that it was an issue with one of the City's departments and that any change will not be approved until it is first approved by the Commission. She suggested that the Commission acknowledge and approve the tile change as well.

COMMISSIONER DALLETT MOVED THAT THE COMMISSION APPROVE THE AMENDMENT TO THE APPROVED CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS CASE NO: 1-HP-2005 AS RECOMMENDED BY STAFF FOR COLOR AND TILE CHANGES IN CERTAIN SPECIFIED AREAS OF TRADER VIC'S. COMMISSIONER HOWARD SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED BY A UNANIMOUS VOTE OF SEVEN (7) TO ZERO (0).

4. Report/Discussion/Possible Action: Garden Apartments Tour, Designation and Outreach

Ms. Abele provided a background overview. A survey was conducted two years ago to determine what postwar multifamily housing in the City is eligible for National Register of Historic Places designation. Seven individual properties and three potential districts were identified in that survey. That information was forwarded to the Historic Register Committee. The Committee recommended to the Commission a historic district designation with 18 properties. Subsequently, it was discovered that there had been changes to some of the buildings since the survey had been conducted and there was a need to recount how many were considered contributors.

A walking tour was conducted on June 3, 2006 of garden apartment complexes to consider eligibility for Register designation, starting at the corner of 69th Street and 2nd Street. Ms. Abele referred to maps that were color coded to indicate eligibility status. Several complexes and individual units were considered ineligible because of alterations and some were not included in the earlier survey due to their age.

In the absence of Commissioner Winslow, Ms. Abele relayed his comments that he sent by email. He felt the district should be limited to individual buildings on 2nd Street from 68th Street to Loma Vista, as he believes they have the strongest character and are the most intact.

Chairperson Wimmer invited members of the public to speak on this topic.

Ms. Valerie Hartzell, Park Paradise Condominiums, 4th Street, stated she was having difficulty with the City on the color that she wants to paint her condominium, which is the historic color. Ms. Abele is to investigate. Ms. Hartzell also inquired as to the process if contractors will not build something

that is in keeping with the structural integrity because of health and safety issues. Ms Abele explained the process and at what step issues such as this could be addressed.

Ms. Tiffany Carlson, Americana, inquired as to what it meant to a homeowner to be designated. Ms. Abele referred her to the handout that includes FAQs. Once a property is designated, any changes made to the exterior of the property requiring a building permit must be approved by the Commission. The Commission cannot prohibit demolition of a structure, but it can delay it for one year. Ms. Carlson indicated Americana residents are happy and excited that they are being considered for designation.

Mr. Mike Bianchi, Scottsdale Palms, La Jacaranda, expressed concern about homeowners not being able to sell their designated properties for demolition if the area became available for redevelopment. Chairperson Wimmer reiterated that the Commission cannot prohibit demolition of a structure, but it can delay it for one year. Mr. Bianchi also expressed concern over an alley that is unsightly and in terrible condition. Chairperson Wimmer explained that if the property were given a historic designation, there are ways to work with the Commission and City staff who would act as advocates on such issues.

Ms. Carol Garey, owner of The Fountains Apartment Complexes, inquired as to the status of matching funds. Ms. Abele stated that currently there is no plan in place. Ms. Garey also inquired as to the status of Shalimar Sands and brought up several issues as to whether the complex was converting to a condominium from a Section 8 property. Ms. Abele stated that, at this stage, the owners have been identified but not contacted. Chairperson Wimmer explained that as the process moves forward, many of these questions/issues would be explored and answered at meetings with the owners.

Mr. Ryan Clintworth (no address given) stated that Valley Vista was a unique property and was curious why it was eliminated on the map. Ms. Abele stated that although it was a nice property, it did not meet the criteria and explained each of these. She also explained that this is a tried and true process that is used nationwide.

Mr. Adam Ochoa (no address given) stated he was in attendance for a friend who had purchased an apartment at White Feather and that owners are ready and willing to make changes and improvements, with direction from the City, to be able to be considered for designation. Ms. Carlson echoed the sentiment.

Ms. Abele stated that she planned to continue with the public meeting process, i.e., meet with HOAs for each project, and report back to the Commission in the fall.

In response to a request by Chairman Wimmer, Commissioner Howard, Chair of the Historic Register Committee, added that Committee members had revisited the area to refresh their memories of what they had looked at two years ago.

Commissioner Dallett opined that the Commission should consider a wider area than 2nd Street for consideration of historic district designation unless and until it is found that there is a need to move back to designating multifamily properties individually. She stated that the very strength of the historic district is the actual clustering in the timeframe in which they were created. This could be something that is unusual in the country. She did not know if there are other similar districts elsewhere in the country or if there are just garden apartment complexes scattered throughout a community. Until this is known, she opined that the Commission should not release any of the boundaries under discussion.

COMMISSIONER DALLETT MOVED THAT THE COMMISSION DIRECT STAFF TO CONDUCT RESEARCH NECESSARY TO ESTABLISH A MULTIFAMILY HISTORIC DISTRICT AND TO BEGIN MEETING WITH INDIVIDUAL GARDEN APARTMENT HOMEOWNERS ASSOCIATIONS. COMMISSIONER HOWARD SECONDED THE MOTION.

THE MOTION CARRIED BY A UNANIMOUS VOTE OF FIVE (5) TO ZERO (0).

5. Report/Discussion/Possible Action: Future Neighborhood Designations

Ms. Abele reported that, after integrity reassessments, Scottsdale Estates 4 is still the best, intact neighborhood historic district candidate, as reported at the last Commission meeting. She proposed that the initiation process begin with letters being mailed to residents and open houses scheduled for late August and early September, with a Commission hearing later in September.

Ms. Abele reported that three alternatives to Sherwood Heights are being assessed. These alternative neighborhoods contain upscale, custom homes. Assessments, along with photographs, will be presented to the Commission at a future meeting.

6. Committee Reports/Meeting Schedules/Discussion

- **Community Outreach Committee – Commissioner Hartz**

In Commissioner Hartz's absence, Ms. Abele reported that they had been in contact with *Atomic Ranch*, and the editors of the quarterly publication expressed an interest in featuring the Commission and its work in their Spring issue.

- **Historic Register Committee – Commissioner Howard**

Commissioner Howard reported that the Committee had had extensive discussion regarding the Charles Miller House and there are concerns about integrity issues, such as the addition of a metal roof that was not part of the original structure. The Committee toured the house on June 3, 2006 and will meet on June 13, 2006 for further discussion. Former Committee members will review their old notes and that information will be forwarded to Commissioner Howard. She distributed copies of recent articles on historic preservation from the *Scottsdale Republic*.

- **Historic Residential Exterior Rehabilitation (HRER) Committee – Commissioner Winslow**

In Commissioner Winslow's absence, Ms. Abele stated they had received 14 applications for historic residential exterior rehabilitation, which have been reviewed for completeness by staff. A Committee meeting will be scheduled soon to review the applications and make recommendations to the Commission on which projects should be funded.

- **Taliesin West Liaison – Commissioner Dallett**

Commissioner Dallett reported the Frank Lloyd Wright Foundation hoped to file their application for Special Campus zoning by the end of June. She requested to have a copy of the plans before they are filed, but this request was denied as that would make it a public document. She was assured that the preliminary master plan she was shown previously, which contained items of special importance to the Commission, was still intact. She was hopeful that the Special Campus zoning application and master plans would be available for Commission review at the next meeting.

In response to an inquiry by Chairperson Wimmer, Commissioner Dallett responded she felt comfortable that the Commission's interests were being addressed.

7. Report/Discussion: HPO Staff Report and Announcements

Ms. Abele reported that a zoning inspector discovered work being done on a house in Village Grove without a building permit. The owner's representative was advised of the review process. A special meeting may have to be scheduled in July to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness.

8. Commissioner Comments and Announcements

In response to inquiries by Commissioner Howard, Ms. Abele responded that she was in the process of putting together the presentation the Commission requested related to 5th Avenue, utilizing the ASU Decision Theater as the venue. The presentation will be a marketing tool and Ms. Abele described the format and content. There would be a series of audiences for the presentation—downtown leadership, property/business owners, and the City Council. The plan is for audiences to be picked up in downtown Scottsdale; driven to Decision Theater in an executive bus; and, after the presentation, driven down 5th Avenue.

Discussion ensued on making the revitalization and preservation of 5th Avenue part of the City's redevelopment plan. Chairperson Wimmer noted that it was a cutting edge opportunity to bring together preservation and economic development.

Commissioner Dallett stated it would behoove the Commission to place on the website links to or excerpts from National Trust articles to assist persons in the community who have questions about historic preservation. Chairperson Wimmer suggested she follow up with staff.

Commissioner Dallett stated she and Commissioner Lockwood attended the City's new Commissioner orientation and requested that a copy of the new ethics code be distributed to the Commissioners.

9. Public Comments

No members of the public wished to address the Commission.

10. Future Meetings and Agenda Items

Chairperson Wimmer requested the Commissioners provide Ms. Abele with their vacation schedules to enable her to schedule the next meeting.

11. Adjournment

With no further business to discuss and no need for an executive session, being duly moved and seconded, the meeting adjourned at 6:54 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,
AV-Tronics, Inc.